

ENFORCEMENT ACTION AGAINST	§	BEFORE THE
ARDC SUTTON II, LTD. WITH RESPECT TO	§	TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF
SUTTON OAKS II	§	HOUSING AND COMMUNITY
(HTC FILE # 12004 / CMTS # 4853)	§	AFFAIRS
	§	

**AGREED FINAL ORDER**

**General Remarks and official action taken:**

On this 17<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2019, the Governing Board (“Board”) of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs (“TDHCA” or “Department”) considered the matter of whether enforcement action should be taken against **ARDC SUTTON II, LTD.**, a Texas limited partnership (“Respondent”).

This Agreed Order is executed pursuant to the authority of the Administrative Procedure Act (“APA”), Tex. Gov’t Code §2001.056, which authorizes the informal disposition of contested cases. In a desire to conclude this matter without further delay and expense, the Board and Respondent agree to resolve this matter by this Agreed Final Order. The Respondent agrees to this Order for the purpose of resolving this proceeding only and without admitting or denying the findings of fact and conclusions of law set out in this Order.

Upon recommendation of the Enforcement Committee, the Board makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law and enters this Order:

**WAIVER**

Respondent acknowledges the existence of their right to request a hearing as provided by Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.044, and to seek judicial review, in the District Court of Travis County, Texas, of any order as provided by Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.047. Pursuant to this compromise and settlement, the Respondent waives those rights and acknowledges the jurisdiction of the Board over Respondent.

**FINDINGS OF FACT (“FOF”)**

**Jurisdiction:**

1. During 2012, Respondent was awarded an allocation of Low Income Housing Tax Credits by the Board, in an annual amount of \$1,990,796 to build and operate Sutton Oaks II (“Property”) (HTC file No. 12004 / CMTS No. 4853 / LDLD No. 811).

2. Respondent signed a land use restriction agreement (“LURA”) regarding the Property. The LURA was effective December 1, 2013, and filed of record at Volume 16484, Page 1961 of the Official Public Records of Real Property of Bexar County, Texas.
3. Respondent is subject to the regulatory authority of TDHCA.

**Compliance Violations<sup>1</sup>:**

4. An on-site monitoring review was conducted on March, 29, 2018, to determine whether Respondent was in compliance with LURA requirements to lease units to low income households and maintain records demonstrating eligibility. The monitoring review found violations of the LURA and TDHCA rules. Notifications of noncompliance were sent and a July 25, 2018, corrective action deadline was set, however, the following violations were not resolved before the corrective action deadline:
  - a. Respondent failed to maintain compliant written tenant selection criteria, a violation of 10 TAC §10.610 (Written Policies and Procedures), which requires all developments to establish written tenant selection criteria that meet minimum TDHCA requirements. Acceptable documentation to correct the finding was submitted on November 5, 2018, 103 days after the corrective action deadline, after intervention by the Enforcement Committee; and
  - b. Respondent failed to provide a Tenant Income Certification and supporting documentation at annual recertification for unit 9204, a violation of 10 TAC §10.612 (Tenant File Requirements), which requires developments to annually recertify the income of each low-income household in a mixed income housing tax credit property. The annual recertification should have been done on March 6, 2018. Acceptable documentation to correct the finding was submitted on October 26, 2018, 93 days after the corrective action deadline, after intervention by the Enforcement Committee.
5. All violations listed above are considered resolved at the time of this Order.

**CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

1. The Department has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to Tex. Gov’t Code §§2306.041-.0503, and 10 TAC §2.
2. Respondent is a “housing sponsor” as that term is defined in Tex. Gov’t Code §2306.004(14).

---

<sup>1</sup> Within this Agreed Final Order, all references to violations of TDHCA Compliance Monitoring rules at 10 TAC Chapter 10 refers to the versions of the code in effect at the time of the compliance monitoring reviews and/or inspections that resulted in recording each violation. All past violations remain violations under the current code and all interim amendments.

3. Pursuant to IRC §42(m)(1)(B)(iii), housing credit agencies are required to monitor for noncompliance with all provisions of the IRC and to notify the Internal Revenue Service of such noncompliance.
4. Respondent violated 10 TAC §10.610 in 2018, by not maintaining compliant written tenant selection criteria meeting TDHCA requirements;
5. Respondent violated 10 TAC §10.612 in 2018, by failing to provide tenant income certification and documentation at recertification for unit 9204;
6. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor with respect to the Property, and has violated TDHCA rules, the Board has personal and subject matter jurisdiction over Respondent pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §2306.041 and §2306.267.
7. Because Respondent is a housing sponsor, TDHCA may order Respondent to perform or refrain from performing certain acts in order to comply with the law, TDHCA rules, or the terms of a contract or agreement to which Respondent and TDHCA are parties, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §2306.267.
8. Because Respondent has violated rules promulgated pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §2306.053 and has violated agreements with the Agency to which Respondent is a party, the Agency may impose an administrative penalty pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code §2306.041.
9. It is appropriate to assess no administrative penalty in accordance with the policies situated at 10 TAC Chapter 2.

Based upon the foregoing findings of fact and conclusions of law, and an assessment of the factors set forth in Tex. Gov't Code §2306.042 to be considered in assessing such penalties as applied specifically to the facts and circumstances present in this case, the Governing Board of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs orders the following:

**IT IS HEREBY ORDERED** that Respondent not be assessed an administrative penalty.

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Respondent shall follow the requirements of 10 TAC §10.406, a copy of which is included at Exhibit 1, and obtain approval from the Department prior to consummating a sale of the property, if contemplated.

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that the terms of this Agreed Final Order shall be published on the TDHCA website.

*[Remainder of page intentionally blank]*

Approved by the Governing Board of TDHCA on January 17, 2019.

By: /s/ J.B. Goodwin  
Name: J.B. Goodwin  
Title: Chair of the Board of TDHCA

By: /s/ James "Beau" Eccles  
Name: James "Beau" Eccles  
Title: Secretary of the Board of TDHCA

**THE STATE OF TEXAS §**  
**§**  
**COUNTY OF TRAVIS §**

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 17th day of January, 2019, personally appeared J.B. Goodwin, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Leah Sargent Rosas  
Notary Public, State of Texas

**THE STATE OF TEXAS §**  
**§**  
**COUNTY OF TRAVIS §**

Before me, the undersigned notary public, on this 17th day of January, 2019, personally appeared James "Beau" Eccles, proved to me to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

(Seal)

/s/ Leah Sargent Rosas  
Notary Public, State of Texas

STATE OF TEXAS §  
COUNTY OF Bexar §

BEFORE ME, Marissa Perez, a notary public in and for the State of Texas, on this day personally appeared David Nisivoccia, known to me or proven to me through Drivers License to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument, and acknowledged to me that (he/she) executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed, who being by me duly sworn, deposed as follows:

1. "My name is David Nisivoccia, I am of sound mind, capable of making this statement, and personally acquainted with the facts herein stated.
2. I hold the office of Secretary/Treasurer for Respondent. I am the authorized representative of Respondent, owner of the Property, which is subject to a Land Use Restriction Agreement monitored by the TDHCA in the State of Texas, and I am duly authorized by Respondent to execute this document.
3. Respondent knowingly and voluntarily enters into this Agreed Final Order, and agrees with and consents to the issuance and service of the foregoing Agreed Order by the Governing Board of the Texas Department of Housing and Community Affairs."

**RESPONDENT:**

**ARDC SUTTON II, LTD.**, a Texas limited partnership

**ARDC SUTTON II GP, LLP**, a Texas limited liability company, its general partner

**SAN ANTONIO HOUSING FACILITY CORPORATION**, a Texas nonprofit corporation, its member

By: /s/ David Nisivoccia

Name: David Nisivoccia

Title: Secretary/Treasurer

Given under my hand and seal of office this 29 day of Jan, 2019.

/s/ Marissa Perez

Signature of Notary Public

Marissa Perez

Printed Name of Notary Public

NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR THE STATE OF TX

My Commission Expires: 7-14-2020

## Exhibit 1

### Texas Administrative Code

TITLE 10	COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
PART 1	TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY AFFAIRS
CHAPTER 10	UNIFORM MULTIFAMILY RULES
SUBCHAPTER E	POST AWARD AND ASSET MANAGEMENT REQUIREMENTS
RULE §10.406	Ownership Transfers (§2306.6713)

---

(a) Ownership Transfer Notification. All multifamily Development Owners must provide written notice to the Department at least thirty (30) calendar days prior to any sale, transfer, or exchange of the Development or any portion of or Controlling interest in the Development. Transfers that are the result of an involuntary removal of the general partner by the investment limited partner must be reported to the Department, as soon as possible due to the sensitive timing and nature of this decision. If the Department determines that the transfer, involuntary removal, or replacement was due to a default by the General Partner under the Limited Partnership Agreement, or other detrimental action that put the Development at risk of failure, staff may make a recommendation to the Board for the debarment of the entity and/or its Principals and Affiliates pursuant to the Department's debarment rule. In addition, a record of transfer involving Principals in new proposed awards will be reported and may be taken into consideration by the Executive Award and Review Committee, in accordance with §1.5 of this title (relating to Previous Participation Reviews), prior to recommending any new financing or allocation of credits.

(b) Requirement. Department approval must be requested for any new member to join in the ownership of a Development. Exceptions include changes to the investment limited partner, non-controlling limited partner, or other partners affiliated with the investment limited partner, or changes resulting from foreclosure wherein the lender or financial institution involved in the transaction is the resulting owner. Any subsequent transfer of the Development will be required to adhere to the process in this section. Furthermore, a Development Owner may not transfer an allocation of tax credits or ownership of a Development supported with an allocation of tax credits to any Person or entity unless the Development Owner obtains the Executive Director's prior, written approval of the transfer. The Executive Director may not unreasonably withhold approval of the transfer requested in compliance with this section. Notwithstanding the foregoing, a Development Owner shall be required to notify the Department but shall not be required to obtain Executive Director approval when the transferee is an Affiliate of the Development Owner with no new members or the transferee is a Related Party who does not Control the Development and the transfer is being made for estate planning purposes.

(c) Transfers Prior to 8609 Issuance or Construction Completion. Transfers (other than those that do not require Executive Director approval, as set forth in subsection (b) of this section) will not be approved prior to the issuance of IRS Form(s) 8609 (for Housing Tax Credits) or the completion of construction (for all Developments funded through other Department programs) unless the Development Owner can provide evidence that the need for the transfer is due to a

hardship (ex. potential bankruptcy, removal by a partner, etc.). The Development Owner must provide the Department with a written explanation describing the hardship and a copy of any applicable agreement between the parties to the transfer, including any Third-Party agreement.

(d) Non-Profit Organizations. If the ownership transfer request is to replace a non-profit organization within the Development ownership entity, the replacement non-profit entity must adhere to the requirements in paragraph (1) or (2) of this subsection.

(1) If the LURA requires ownership or material participation in ownership by a Qualified Non-Profit

Organization, and the Development received Tax Credits pursuant to §42(h)(5) of the Code, the transferee must be a Qualified Non-Profit Organization that meets the requirements of §42(h)(5) of the Code and Texas Government Code §2306.6706.

(2) If the LURA requires ownership or material participation in ownership by a qualified non-profit organization, but the Development did not receive Tax Credits pursuant to §42(h)(5) of the Code, the Development Owner must show that the transferee is a non-profit organization that complies with the LURA.

(e) Historically Underutilized Business ("HUB") Organizations. If a HUB is the general partner of a Development Owner and it (i) is being removed as the result of a default under the organizational documents of the Development Owner or (ii) determines to sell its ownership interest, in either case, after the issuance of 8609s, the purchaser of that general partnership interest is not required to be a HUB as long as the LURA does not require such continual ownership or a material LURA amendment is approved. Such approval can be obtained concurrent with Board approval described herein. All such transfers must be approved by the Board and require that the Board find that:

(1) the selling HUB is acting of its own volition or is being removed as the result of a default under the organizational documents of the Development Owner;

(2) the participation by the HUB has been substantive and meaningful, or would have been substantial and meaningful had the HUB not defaulted under the organizational documents of the Development Owner, enabling it to realize not only financial benefit but to acquire skills relating to the ownership and operation of affordable housing; and

(3) the proposed purchaser meets the Department's standards for ownership transfers

(f) Documentation Required. A Development Owner must submit documentation requested by the Department to enable the Department to understand fully the facts and circumstances that gave rise to the need for the transfer and the effects of approval or denial. Documentation includes but is not limited to:

(1) a written explanation outlining the reason for the request;

(2) a list of the names of transferees and Related Parties;

(3) detailed information describing the experience and financial capacity of transferees and related parties holding an ownership interest of 10 percent or greater in any Principal or Controlling entity;

(4) evidence and certification that the tenants in the Development have been notified in writing of the proposed transfer at least thirty (30) calendar days prior to the date the transfer is approved by the Department. The ownership transfer approval letter will not be issued until this 30 day period has expired.

(g) Within five (5) business days after the date the Department receives all necessary information under this section, staff shall initiate a qualifications review of a transferee, in accordance with §1.5 of this title, to determine the transferee's past compliance with all aspects of the Department's programs, LURAs and eligibility under this chapter.

(h) Credit Limitation. As it relates to the Housing Tax Credit amount further described in §11.4(a) of this title (relating to Tax Credit Request and Award Limits), the credit amount will not be applied in circumstances described in paragraphs (1) and (2) of this subsection:

(1) in cases of transfers in which the syndicator, investor or limited partner is taking over ownership of the Development and not merely replacing the general partner; or

(2) in cases where the general partner is being replaced if the award of credits was made at least five (5) years prior to the transfer request date.

(i) Penalties. The Development Owner must comply with any additional documentation requirements as stated in Subchapter F of this chapter (relating to Compliance Monitoring). The Development Owner, as on record with the Department, will be liable for any penalties imposed by the Department even if such penalty can be attributable to the new Development Owner unless such ownership transfer is approved by the Department.

(j) Ownership Transfer Processing Fee. The ownership transfer request must be accompanied by corresponding ownership transfer fee as outlined in §10.901 of this chapter (relating to Fee Schedule).

**Source Note:** The provisions of this §10.406 adopted to be effective December 9, 2014, 39 TexReg 9518